



Waste Management Committee Meeting Minutes

Held on

Wednesday 17 May 2017

Commencing at 4.00pm

In the Seniors' Room

Donnybrook Community Library, Emerald Street, Donnybrook WA 6239

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "BGR" followed by a flourish.

Benjamin (Ben) Rose
Chief Executive Officer

18 May 2017

DISCLAIMER

The advice and information contained herein is given by and to the Council without liability or responsibility for its accuracy. Before placing any reliance on this advice or information, a written inquiry should be made to the Council giving entire reasons for seeking the advice or information and how it is proposed to be used.

Please note this agenda contains recommendations which have not yet been adopted by Council.



WASTE MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

17 May 2017

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	NOMINATION OF PRESIDING OFFICER.....	3
2	NOMINATION OF DEPUTY PRESIDING OFFICER	3
3	PUBLIC QUESTION TIME	3
4	DECLARATION OF FINANCIAL INTEREST	4
5	PETITIONS/DEPUTATIONS/PRESENTATIONS	4
6	CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING.....	4
7	REPORTS OF OFFICERS.....	4
7.1	Manager of Development and Environmental Services	4
7.1.1	ECONOMIC REVIEW: DONNYBROOK WASTE MANAGEMENT FACILITY – FUTURE OPTIONS.....	4
7.1.2	RECOMMENDATION TO THE BUNBURY WELLINGTON GROUP OF COUNCILS COUNTRY LOCAL GOVERNMENT FUNDING REGIONAL ALLOCATION	12
8	CLOSURE OF MEETING	15

SHIRE OF DONNYBROOK BALINGUP WASTE MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE MEETING

**Held in Seniors' Room, Donnybrook Community Library
on Wednesday 17 May 2017 at 4.00pm**

The CEO to declare the meeting open at 4.05pm, and call for nominations for Presiding Officer.

MEMBERS PRESENT

COUNCILLORS

Cr Dilley
Cr Logiudice
Cr Mitchell

STAFF/GUESTS

Ben Rose – Chief Executive Officer
Leigh Guthridge – Manager Development and Environmental Services
Jeff Somes – Principal Environmental Health Officer
Giles Perryman - Consultant, ASK Waste Management
Alison Edmonds – Consultant, ASK Waste Management

PUBLIC GALLERY

Nil

APOLOGIES

Nil

1 NOMINATION OF PRESIDING OFFICER

Cr Mitchell nominated Cr Logiudice to the position of Presiding Officer. In the absence of any further nominations, the CEO duly declared Cr Logiudice elected as the Presiding Officer of the Committee.

Cr Logiudice took the Chair and called for nominations of the position of Deputy Presiding Officer.

2 NOMINATION OF DEPUTY PRESIDING OFFICER

Cr Logiudice nominated Cr Dilley to the position of Deputy Presiding Officer. In the absence of any further nominations Cr Dilley was duly declared elected as Deputy Presiding Officer of the Committee.

3 PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

Nil

4 DECLARATION OF INTEREST/S

Division 6: Sub-Division 1 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. Care should be taken by all Committee members to ensure that a financial interest is declared and that they refrain from voting on any matter considered may come within the ambit of the Act.

Nil

5 PETITIONS/DEPUTATIONS/PRESENTATIONS

Mr Giles Perryman, Consultant from ASK Waste Management, provided a summary of the findings from the Economic Review – Waste Facility Future Options report.

6 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

Moved: Cr Mitchell

Seconded: Cr Dilley

That the Minutes of the Waste Management Committee Meeting held on 18 August 2015 be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Carried 3/0

7 REPORTS OF OFFICERS

7.1 Manager of Development and Environmental Services

7.1.1 ECONOMIC REVIEW: DONNYBROOK WASTE MANAGEMENT FACILITY – FUTURE OPTIONS

Location:	Goodwood Road Donnybrook
Applicants:	Shire of Donnybrook Balingup
Zone:	State Forest
File Ref:	HLT 09/2
Author:	Leigh Guthridge – Manager Development and Environmental Services (<i>Jeff Somes – Principal Environmental Health Officer</i>)
Report Date:	4 May 2017
Attachment:	7.1.1 - ASK Waste Management – Economic Review - Waste Facility Future Options

The purpose of this report is to:

1. Present the recommendations from the ASK Waste Management - *Economic Review - Waste Facility Future Options* (the Report) for options for the Shire for future waste management services, including disposal of waste received at the Donnybrook Waste Management Facility (DWMF).
2. Present a timeline for the implementation of the recommendations contained within the economic review.

Background

The Shire operates the DWMF situated at Goodwood Rd, Donnybrook as its landfill for waste generated within the Shire.

The DWMF receives a combination of municipal solid waste through:

- Public drop off;
- Municipal kerbside collection; and
- Commercial and demolition waste.

In the past 12 months it is estimated that 5,300 tonnes of waste was landfilled at the DWMF. The current working area of the landfill site is nearing capacity. Recent waste disposal improvements that have extended the longevity of the existing landfill area include:

- Introducing the organics bins service to 1,250 properties within the Shire and thereby diverting approximately 800 tonnes of organic waste per annum; and
- The use of a waste compactor vehicle at the DWMF to improve compaction of waste within the landfill area.

Based upon the final gradients, as stipulated in the facility's Landfill Closure Management Plan, it is estimated that there is approximately 1-2 years of void space remaining.

The Shire has obtained a conditional Works Approval from the Department of Environment and Regulation (DER) to construct an additional landfill cell on the adjoining cleared land. The volume of land filling capacity within the proposed 'new cell' is 72,500m³, with an anticipated life of 7 years.

The DER concluded, based upon the information provided in the Works Approval application, that the design of the new landfill area may present an unacceptable level of risk to groundwater unless engineering controls are imposed to mitigate that risk in line with Best Practice Environmental Management (BPEM) Guidelines.

Some of the regulatory controls imposed by the DER in the Works Approval include:

- A reduction in the size of the extension area by approximately 50% to reduce the risk of the landfill extending into the contact point of the Leederville aquifer.
- The installation of a geo-synthetic liner.
- The installation of two additional ground water monitoring bores.
- The base of the landfill cell graded to an impervious sump for leachate collection. The sump will be required to have a capacity to store leachates generated during a one-off extreme rainfall event (1 in 10yr, 72 hour events).
- Installation of an additional leachate monitoring and extraction bore to pump leachate to an impermeable (lined) leachate lagoon (Note: the physical constraints of the site mean that there is not available area to locate a suitably sized leachate lagoon).

Based on the anticipated capital, operational and whole of life costs of extending the landfill footprint (to meet environmental standards via the proposed engineering controls) it was prudent for the Shire to evaluate the costs of all options associated with disposing of waste before committing to the capital works of installing a new cell.

Comment

ASK Waste Management was commissioned to undertake an economic review of the Shire's future waste disposal options and associated waste services. The Report details:

- Current waste management practices;
- Future disposal options available to the Shire;
- Conceptualised design criteria for landfill and transfer station options;
- Model inputs;
- Financial results;
- Social, economic and political assessment;
- Evaluation of outcomes; and
- Future funding options.

The Options for waste disposal examined include:

- Option 1a: DWMF extension Phase 1 – construction of the first of two landfill cells;
- Option 1b: DWMF extension Phase 2 – construction of both landfill cells;
- Option 2a: Construct a transfer station and dispose of waste at the Bunbury Harvey Regional Council (BHRC) landfill site as a customer;
- Option 2b: Construction of a transfer station and disposal of waste at the BHRC landfill site as a member Council; or
- Option 2c: Construction of a transfer station and disposal of waste at Banksia Road Dardanup (owned by Cleanaway) as a customer.

Based upon the modelling undertaken, ASK prepared total annualised costs for each scenario based upon operating the current standard of waste services in combination with the various options to enable comparisons to be undertaken.

The annualised cost and expected operational life, where applicable, of these options are summarised below:

Option	Projected Annual Cost	Operational life based upon current volumes
Current Costs – landfilling of the existing landfilling area to its maximum height and gradients	\$1,086,000	1 - 2 years
Option 1a: DWMF extension Phase 1	\$1,260,000	9 years
Option 1b: DWMF extension Phase 2	\$1,200,000	24 years
Option 2a: Transfer station and disposal of waste at the BHRC landfill site as a customer	\$1,210,000	N/A
Option 2b: Transfer station and disposal of waste at the BHRC landfill site as a member Council	\$1,180,000	N/A
Option 2c: Transfer station and disposal of waste at Banksia Road Dardanup (Cleanaway) as a customer	\$1,170,000	N/A

The Report and financial modelling recommends that when the existing landfill footprint reaches capacity that the Shire select option 2c, (transfer station and transport of waste to

Cleanaway) as the preferred long term disposal option for the Shire based on whole of life costing and associated risks of developing a new cell that meets BPEM Guidelines.

It is noted that the costs of landfill disposal and transport that are incorporated into the financial modelling are based on advice that landfill owners/managers provided to ASK Waste Management at the time of compiling the Report. If the Shire accepts the recommendation to transfer waste to an alternative site it will need to test these prices through a tender process.

This option will increase the current waste management expenditure by approximately \$84,000 per annum.

Other Waste Management Issues – Fees and Services

Additional recommendations from the Report relating to fees, charges and services were provided with the view of increasing revenue and potentially reducing costs. These recommendations include:

Recommendation	Comment
Limit tip passes to 52 x 240L tokens for residents with no kerbside collection service and introduce two bulk waste passes for all residents.	<p>The current tip pass systems offers almost unlimited ‘free’ waste disposal to land owners who receive a tip pass. A limit of 52 x 240L passes will restrict the quantities of general household waste from homes without a kerbside service to the equivalent of a home with the kerbside service. The restrictions on volume will provide incentive to residents without a bin service to separate their recyclables.</p> <p>The introduction of a bulk pass system will enable residents to dispose of a reasonable volume of household junk each year for free. Each pass would equate to a 6 x 4 trailer or its equivalent.</p>
Increase commercial gate fees by 40%, however, if tip pass changes impact on commercial waste revenue as expected only a 20% increase would be required.	The gate fees for commercial waste are currently below cost neutral, meaning commercial waste disposal is being subsidised by domestic ratepayers.
Increase the fee for the Shire’s kerbside commercial waste service (240L MGB) by a minimum of \$40	<p>The current commercial bin charge does not cover the full cost of collection and disposal. A \$40.00 increase per commercial bin is required to achieve cost neutral.</p> <p>The new price point should encourage commercial operators to increase their uptake of the recyclable and organic bin services.</p>
Undertake a review of the operation of both	This recommendation requires further

Recommendation	Comment
the Donnybrook Waster Management Facility and the Balingup Transfer Station	investigation.
Review the opening hours of the Balingup Transfer Station	Balingup Transfer Stations is open for a total of 18 hours over 4 days each week. On average just 10 tonnes of waste material is received each week at the BS. There is scope to reduce the opening hours given the low volume of waste accepted.
Review the options of providing a kerbside collection for the whole Shire compared to the provision of the current drop-off services	<p>This option would be problematic given the remoteness of many dwellings and the lack of suitable access for the waste vehicles.</p> <p>There is scope to further roll out the organics bin service to those residents within rural/residential areas. The organics bin service will divert more waste from landfill stream. Such a service would provide residents an alternative means to reduce fuel loads around their homes during the summer period when burning is prohibited.</p>
Improve the transparency of the fee structure for domestic services between kerbside collection and Waste Management Levy	The current kerbside collection fee covers the collection cost only and does not include the cost of the wastes' disposal. It is recommended that a single fee be developed covering the total cost (collection and disposal) which is separate to the Waste Management Levy which should fund the cost of operating the Shire's landfill and transfer station facilities.

Regional Waste Facility

The Bunbury Wellington Group of Councils (BWGC) has been actively exploring the development of a Regional Waste Facility and in recent years and was successful in obtaining funding under the Council Local Government Fund – Regional Allocation to assist with the purchase of a site.

The planning for this is still in its infancy stage with feasibility for an appropriate site still progressing. It is expected that if a Regional Waste Facility is developed it will be many years before it will be available for use by local government. There is much more planning required addressing the political, regulatory, environmental and social requirements of developing a regional waste facility.

The potential delays in developing a Regional Waste Facility where the Shire may use the facility does not impact on the direction that the Shire takes now in transitioning from operating a landfill at the DWMF to transferring waste to an alternative landfill facility in the short to medium term. There are already sufficient approved land fill facilities in the Bunbury

area that meet contemporary standards with capacity to take the Shires waste and offer competitive prices for disposal.

Conclusion

Based upon the findings of the Report, ASK recommends that the Shire establish a transfer station at the DWMF once the existing landfill footprint reaches capacity and transport waste received at the DWMF to Cleanaway landfill facility at Banskia Road, Dardanup. However, the selection of which landfill facility will be determined by the cost of waste disposal and transport of waste after testing the market via a tender process.

It is proposed that moving in the direction of providing a transfer station at the DWMF be carried out in stages:

- From 1 July 2018, all putrescible waste collected via the kerbside collection service be directed away from the DWMF and the DWMF cease accepting commercial waste vehicles (i.e skip bins/tipper trucks) to prolong the capacity of the existing landfill area; and
- Develop the transfer station when the existing landfill space is exhausted at which time waste received from drop-off waste and municipal bin waste (Shire street bins) will be redirected off site.

The progressive transition will provide the Shire with the time to plan and budget to develop a modern transfer station facility to meet best practice and consult with the community.

It is also proposed that other recommendations relating to fees, charges and the level of service provided be adopted and implemented progressively as per the recommendation to this report.

Consultation

Mr Tony Battersby – Chief Executive Officer of the Bunbury- Harvey Regional Council provided comment on the findings and recommendation of the report prepared by ASK Waste Management.

Policy/Statutory/Voting Implications

Policy

Shire of Donnybrook Balingup Environmental Health Policies: 6.6 - Balingup Waste Transfer Station

Statutory

Environmental Protection Act 1986

Voting

Simple majority

Financial Implications

The cost of the Economic Review was \$25,300 (Ex – GST) and this project was budgeted and funded from the Donnybrook Waste Management Facility operations account.

Strategic Implications

Outcome 2.2 – Efficient and effective waste management

Strategy 2.2.3 - Continue to provide waste management infrastructure to accommodate the waste management needs of the community.

Officer’s Recommended Resolution

Moved: Cr Seconded: Cr

The Waste Management Committee recommend to Council that:

- 1) Council endorse the recommendations of the ASK Waste Management - Economic Review Waste Facility Future Options report dated March 2017.**
- 2) When the existing landfill footprint reaches capacity that the Shire develop a transfer station and transport waste to an alternative landfill site as the preferred long term disposal option for the Shire of Donnybrook Balingup.**
- 3) The Shire of Donnybrook Balingup seeks Tenders/Expression of Interest for an alternative landfill provider to provide a cost of waste disposal and transport of waste to their landfill facility.**
- 4) Council implement the other recommendations relating to other waste services and fees as per the following time frames:**

From 1 July 2017:

- Increase the commercial gate fee by up to 20%.**
- Increase the general waste service charge (240L general waste bins) applied to commercial premises by a minimum of \$40.00 per bin to cover the actual incurred costs of waste disposal.**
- Undertake a review of commercial premises to ensure that they are being levied for the correct number of bins.**
- Consider implementation of the expansion (subject to obtaining funding through the Better Bins Program) of the organics bin service to residents in rural-residential areas from 1 July 2018.**

From 1 July 2018:

- Refuse acceptance of waste from commercial vehicles at the Donnybrook Waste Management Facility including skip bins and tipper trucks.**
- Amend the tip pass system for eligible residents to 52 x 240L tokens and four (4) bulk waste passes (6 x 4 trailer or the equivalent) for residents with no kerbside collection service and four (4) bulk waste passes for those with a kerbside collection service.**

- Amend the fee structure for the kerbside charge and Waste Management Levy to reflect their respective costs of service addressing current cross subsidisation.
- Undertake a review of the Donnybrook Waste Management Facility and the Balingup Transfer Station to review the costs of contracting these services as compared to providing Shire staff for these services.
- Undertake a review the opening hours of the Balingup Transfer Station in view of providing a service which is more commensurate with its level of usage.

Cr Dilley moved the Officer's recommended resolution with the following amendments:

**Committee's Recommended Resolution
(Officer's Recommended Resolution)**

Moved: Cr Dilley

Seconded: Cr Mitchell

The Waste Management Committee recommend to Council that:

- 1) Council endorse the recommendations of the ASK Waste Management - Economic Review Waste Facility Future Options report dated March 2017.
- 2) When the existing landfill footprint reaches capacity, inclusive of the existing hardstand area, that the Shire develop a transfer station and transport waste to an alternative landfill site as the preferred long term disposal option for the Shire of Donnybrook Balingup.
- 3) Council implement the other recommendations relating to other waste services and fees as per the following time frames:

From 1 July 2017:

- Increase the commercial gate fee by up to 20%.
- Increase the general waste service charge (240L general waste bins) applied to commercial premises by a minimum of \$40.00 per bin to cover the actual incurred costs of waste disposal.
- Undertake a review of commercial premises to ensure that they are being levied for the correct number of bins.
- Consider implementation of the expansion (subject to obtaining funding through the Better Bins Program) of the organics bin service to residents in rural-residential areas from 1 July 2018.

From 1 July 2018:

- Refuse acceptance of commercial waste from outside the Shire of Donnybrook Balingup at the Donnybrook Waste Management Facility.
- Amend the tip pass system for eligible residents to 52 x 240L tokens and four (4) bulk waste passes (6 x 4 trailer or the equivalent) for residents with no kerbside collection service and four (4) bulk waste passes for those with a kerbside collection service.

- Amend the fee structure for the kerbside charge and Waste Management Levy to reflect their respective costs of service addressing current cross subsidisation.
- Undertake a review of the Donnybrook Waste Management Facility and the Balingup Transfer Station to review the costs of contracting these services as compared to providing Shire staff for these services.
- Undertake a review the opening hours of the Balingup Transfer Station in view of providing a service which is more commensurate with its level of usage.

Carried 3/0

7.1.2 RECOMMENDATION TO THE BUNBURY WELLINGTON GROUP OF COUNCILS COUNTRY LOCAL GOVERNMENT FUNDING REGIONAL ALLOCATION

Location:	Various
Applicants:	Shire of Donnybrook Balingup
Zone:	State Forest
File Ref:	HLT 09/2
Author:	Ben Rose – Chief Executive Officer
Report Date:	10 May 2017
Attachment:	7.1.2 – Confidential Discussion Paper

Background

The Bunbury Wellington Group of Councils (BWGC) was formed in 1998 and consists of the following members:

- Shire of Capel
- Shire of Dardanup
- Shire of Collie
- Shire of Donnybrook-Balingup
- Shire of Harvey
- Shire of Boyup-Brook
- City of Bunbury

The group has been actively exploring the development of a Regional Waste Facility and in recent years, was successful in obtaining funding under the Council Local Government Fund – Regional Allocation to assist with the purchase of a site.

As an outcome of the decision of the Shire of Dardanup to go to public tender for the sale of the Banksia Road site, this is no longer an option to pursue.

There is a need to consider the implications in the longer term for the south west local governments in relation to waste management and the preferred approach to take to the next BWGC Meeting.

Detailed background regarding this project and options for submission to the next BWGC meeting are contained within the Confidential discussion paper (Attachment 7.1.2)

Contained within the South West Regional Blueprint is the following project:

Sustainable energy supply - Ensure there is access to sustainable, affordable energy supplies to support a growing region. The region is able to expand its economic and population base through the provision of adequate energy supplies and reliable distribution networks, and makes best possible use of renewable energy and provides an alternative source of fuel to coal as coal stocks deplete.

The South West has secure and sustainable energy supplies for a population of 500,000. All waste is recycled into energy production or alternative.

Regional waste - Build subregional waste facilities capable of recycling and managing waste to a forecast regional population of 500,000. All waste is recycled into energy production or alternative.

In order to progress the priorities outlined in the draft South West Regional Blueprint and to meet the short medium and long term requirements of local governments in the region and broader south west as it relates to waste management.

A Special Meeting of the BWGC will be convened in May and therefore, there is the requirement to have a preferred Council position that will be able to be presented to the meeting.

Comment

The Bunbury Wellington Group of Councils (BWGC) has been actively exploring the development of a Regional Waste Facility and was successful in obtaining funding under the CLGF Regional Funding Round to assist with the purchase of a site.

As a member of the Bunbury Wellington Group of Councils, and given the work undertaken to date in relation to the development of a regional approach to waste management, it is considered appropriate for Council to consider and accept the preferred way forward.

As there are numerous matters within the attached paper and linkages to the priorities outlined in the draft South West Regional Blueprint there is a need for the group to consider how regional waste will be progressed.

In the event that the group of Councils is unsuccessful in continuing with a regional waste site, the short term implications will be the requirement to negotiate a commercial arrangement with a private provider or another local government. Whilst these costs can be

met in the short to medium term, the lack of control over pricing in the longer term would be outside of the control of Council.

As the Group have secured funding via the CLGF this provides some scope for the group to consider alternative sites, however the deadline for this to occur is still relatively tight. As such, the group will need to consider how it wants to approach the funding and other associated matters.

Consultation

This report serves to bring the matter to the attention of all elected members, prior to referral to the other local government in the BWGC and to provide some direction for the Mayor in representing the Council preferred position/direction.

Policy/Statutory/Voting Implications

Voting

Simple majority

Financial Implications

Funding for this project has been secured via the CLGF. BWGC are required to advise their decision by 31 May 2017 to avoid losing the funding allocation. The Grant funding is required to be spent by 31 December 2017 and any unspent funds refunded.

Strategic Implications

Outcome 2.2 – Efficient and effective waste management

Committee's Recommended Resolution (Officer's Recommended Resolution)

Moved: Cr Dilley

Seconded: Cr Mitchell

- 1. That Council authorise the options proposed for the Country Local Government Funding Regional Allocation and South West Regional Waste Management Site to be submitted for consideration at the next Bunbury Wellington Group of Councils Meeting, with Option 1 being the preferred Council position, along with the two other recommendations contained in the report.**
- 2. That in the event that there is no support for Option 1, the President be authorised to consider alternatives provided by the other Local Governments and support a position which will see a positive outcome for the Shire.**

Carried 3/0

8 CLOSURE OF MEETING

The Chairperson advised that the date of the next Waste Management Committee meeting will be convened when required.

The Chairperson declared the meeting closed 5.50pm